

PRESENTERS



Vanessa Bruton, Barrister, Auckland

Vanessa is an Auckland barrister, practising almost exclusively in trust and estate disputes, including relationship property disputes where trusts are involved. Her practice includes both domestic and international trust disputes where there is a New Zealand law or jurisdiction aspect. She is a member of STEP (Society of Trust and Estate Practitioners) and a frequent speaker at NZLS, ADLS and other seminars.



Isaac Hikaka, LeeSalmonLong, Auckland

Isaac is a partner at the specialist dispute resolution firm, LeeSalmonLong. He has particular expertise in disputes involving the interaction between trusts and other areas of the law, including complex relationship property claims, international trust disputes and trust and regulatory issues. Isaac regularly appears as counsel in such disputes, and has acted for husbands, wives, trustees and beneficiaries.

The statements and conclusions contained in this paper are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be relied upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----------|
| HOT TOPICS IN THE INTERACTION BETWEEN TRUSTS AND RELATIONSHIP PROPERTY | 1 |
| | |
| POWERS AS PROPERTY – <i>CLAYTON V CLAYTON</i> | 2 |
| <i>Claims against powers to appoint and remove trustees</i> | 3 |
| <i>Observations for lawyers and trustees</i> | 4 |
| <i>Sham, alter ego and illusory trust claims</i> | 5 |
| CONSTRUCTIVE TRUST CLAIMS AGAINST TRUST PROPERTY | 8 |
| <i>Constructive trust claims against trust property – the position</i> | 8 |
| <i>Constructive trust claims against trust property – the consequences</i> | 9 |
| <i>Constructive trust claims against trust property – how to minimise the chance of successful claims</i> 10 | |
| A NOTE ON S 182..... | 10 |
| CLAIMS AGAINST TRUSTEES AND TRUST PROPERTY WHEN A RELATIONSHIP ENDS BY DEATH | 11 |
| <i>Thurston v Thurston</i> | 11 |
| <i>The story</i> | 12 |
| <i>Property ownership structures</i> | 12 |
| <i>Thurston Litigation – round one</i> | 15 |
| <i>Thurston Litigation - round two</i> | 15 |
| <i>Lessons for trustees and their advisors from rounds one and two</i> | 16 |
| <i>Thurston Litigation - round three</i> | 17 |
| <i>Lessons from Thurston round three</i> | 19 |
| CAPACITY AND UNDUE INFLUENCE CLAIMS | 19 |
| <i>Capacity to exercise power to appoint trustees?</i> | 19 |
| <i>Mental Capacity Act 2005 (England and Wales)</i> | 20 |
| <i>Capacity to apply for division of relationship property?</i> | 21 |
| <i>Undue Influence</i> | 22 |
| <i>Lessons to consider on the capacity and undue influence front</i> | 22 |
| <i>Conclusions</i> | 23 |
| APPENDIX | 25 |